

# USSR / Comintern Alliance With the KMT & the CCP

by Ah Xiang

Excerpts from “Tragedy of Chinese Revolution” at <http://www.republicanchina.org/tragedy.html> For updates and related articles, check <http://www.republicanchina.org/RepublicanChina-pdf.htm>

The Soviets, who purportedly on 25 July 1919 hoodwinked the Chinese with a declaration of intent to transfer the Russian ownership of the railway to China free of compensation, issued a second Karakhan manifesto on 27 September 1920, shortly after the Chinese government revoked the Czarist legation and diplomatic privileges in China. Taking advantage of the schism between North China and South China, and the schism between North China and Manchuria, the Soviets, other than dispatching Comintern agents to China and creating a Mongolia People’s revolutionary Party in Moscow in 1920, attempted striking agreements on Mongolia and the Chinese Eastern Railway with the northern government in Peking and the regional overlord in Manchuria.

At least three Soviet agencies were involved in China proper's politics, including a Soviet emissary to the Peking government, a Comintern representative stationed in Shanghai and a Soviet news agency in Guangzhou (Canton). When the Soviets temporarily controlled Vladivostok, Grigorii N. Voitinsky was dispatched to China by V.D. Vilensky (Sibiryakov). Voitinsky (Zarkhin), known as Wu Tingkang in Chinese, arrived in Peking in spring 1920 together with Yang Mingzai, an overseas Chinese who joined the Bolshevik revolution. Through the referral of Russian professors S.N. Polevoi (Boliev) and A.I. Ivanov (Ivin), Voitinsky met Li Dazhao, a leader of the Young China Society. Subsequently, Voitinsky obtained Li Dazhao’s referral to meet with Chen Duxiu, publisher of the *La Jeunesse* magazine in Shanghai, and helped to organize a “socialist alliance”, termed the “revolutionary bureaux” in Voitinsky reports, in June 1920. In August 1920, Voitinsky renamed Chen Duxiu’s newly-proposed “Chinese Social Communist Party” to the Communist Party of China (CPC) before moving on to liaison with military strongman Wu Peifu, while Yang Mingzai stayed on to support Yu Xiusong in founding the Socialist Youth Corps of Shanghai. By May 1921, prior to the first congress, seven provincial communist headquarters were set up in Peking, Tientsin, Hankow, Shanghai, Canton, Hongkong and Nanking, where the communist party founders utilized the Young China Society framework to steer members to communism from inside out.<sup>1</sup> Separately, the Soviet Far

---

<sup>1</sup> The three Soviet groups had different agenda and objectives and often had conflicting functions and redundant tasks. Voitinsky and Maring were responsible for developing and organizing the CCP. Maring and Joffe were responsible for changing Comintern's "Irkutsk line" to full cooperation with Sun Yat-sen. Voitinsky (Wei-jing-si-ji) worked with Li Dazhao and Zhang Guotao in Beijing as early as 1920. Comintern established a 'Russo-Chinese News Agency' in Shanghai, with a branch in Beijing. ('Russo-Chinese News Agency' also set up a branch in Canton.) Voitinsky and four Chinese revolutionaries set up a 'revolutionary committee' in Shanghai, with three offices of publication, information and organization. This 'revolutionary committee' had hosted "conference of students' representatives" in Beijing and resulted in the 'Socialist Youth League' of China on Aug 17th of 1922. Replacing Voitinsky would be Comintern Rep Maring who worked with Chen Duxiu in Shanghai on establishing the Chinese Communist Party (CCP), with Chen's "The New Youth" magazine and its 7-8 centers across the nation as a nexus. At the absence of Chen Duxiu who left for a education post in Guangdong Province, Maring assisted Zhang Guotao in founding the CCP in July 1921 as a branch of the Comintern. Maring pushed through the Moscow demand, at the Second CCP National Session, to have CCP ally with KMT in June of 1922 against the objections of Zhang Guotao. Zhang Guotao, having

Eastern Republic sent agents to Manchuria to initiate diplomatic recognition talks and strike railway, trade and other bilateral deals. In 1921, Zhang Zuolin, as [[东北四省经略使]] managing superintendent for the four northeastern provinces, hired Yang Zhuo, an undercover Soviet agent, as liaison bureau director for dealings with the Russians and the Soviets.

In Shanghai, Sun Yat-sen, who held probing talks with Potapoff, Popoff, Matriev Borid Grigori Voitinsky and Liu Jiang (刘江 an overseas Chinese at the China OrgBuro (organizational bureau) of the Soviet Communist Party) etc al., throughout 1920, sent his former bodyguard regimental commander, Li Zhangda, to the Soviet Union in September 1920 for striking a military alliance with the Soviets to pincer-attack the northern government from south and west in a proposed joint offensive in spring 1921. In return, Soclov Stlahoff, who met Li Zhangda at Blagoveschensk before the latter's continuous trip to Moscow, entered Manchuria in November as a reporter and subsequently met with KMT generals such as Li Liejun in Shanghai. In late 1920, Sun Yat-sen returned to power in South China and tacked on the post of president extraordinaire of the Republic of China in 1921. In August 1921, Sun Yat-sen, who was overconfident of his military strength, put aside the proposed Soviet military alliance scheme. Sun Yat-sen, through the Soviet trade mission in London, replied to Soviet foreign minister Chicherin's letter that was written one month after the September 1920 Karakhan manifesto but not delivered till mid-June 1921, requesting with the Soviets to defer striking an agreement with the Peking government till his Nationalist Party "finished with the reactionaries and counter-revolutionaries" in Peking, per Allen Sues Whiting.

On October 31<sup>st</sup>, 1921, Georgii Chicherin wired to Chita Republic's foreign affairs ministry to inquire about the possibility of establishing relations with the Canton Government without antagonizing the Peking Government. With Lenin's approval, Chicherin instructed the Soviet emissary to China, A. K. Paikes, to have secretive contacts with Sun Yat-sen in Canton. Henk Sneevliet (Maring), in the company of communist Zhang Tailei, traveled to southern China, where he met with Sun Yat-sen at Guilin, Guangxi Province in December 1921. A Dutch Comintern agent, Sneevliet was sent to China under the name of H. Maring (马林) to assist with the convening of the First Congress of the Communist Party of China in July 1921 as well as the organization of the Labor Secretariat. Maring discussed with Sun Yat-sen in three talks about the Soviet revolution, reorganization of the KMT to ally with peasants and workers, establishment of a military academy to train cadets, and allowing the CCP members to join in. Sun Yat-sen, whose military campaign in Guangxi went smoothly at the time, put off the Soviet suggestion, claiming that a premature alliance with the Soviets could trigger intervention by the powers and the alliance with the Soviets was in fact impossible prior to the success of his northern expedition [against the Peking government]. The following January, Sun Yat-sen sent Zhang Qiubai as the KMT representative to the Jan 1922 Soviet Far East Conference 远东劳动人民代表大会, during which Lenin made an exception to receiving the KMT representative and talked about the necessity of conducting anti-imperialism work in China. In the January 1922, Maring observed Seaman's Strike in Canton/HK, and later on 20 June 1923 claimed to Zinoviev, Bukharin, and

---

suffered a setback when Wu Peifu cracked down on the Feb 7th 1923 Jing-han Railroad Workers' Strike, agreed to shift CCP's revolutionary agenda to Shanghai/Guangzhou in the south and accept the KMT-CCP alliance during the Second Plenary of the Second CCP National Session. CCP agreed with Maring that China's revolution should go through two stages the same way as USSR had undergone the 1905 & 1917 revolutions, i.e., i) democratic revolution and ii) socialist revolution.

Radek [Karol Sobelson] that if he “had not seen the nationalist movement in the south”, he “would have proposed to the ECCI that it support only Profintern work [in China] and to refrain from the artificial demand of the [Chinese] Communist Party”, meaning that he saw bright hope of developing communism through the alliance with the KMT party whereas Chinese Communists by June 1923 possessed 420 members; “most members have no job, so that the Party has virtually no links with workers in factories, [or] with low-level civil servants, teachers etc. who work; and that “it was born much too early (in 1920) or, more correctly, fabricated...” per Tony Saich in “The origins of the first United Front in China: the role of Sneevliet (alias Maring)”.

On October 24, 1921, China granted permission for the Russian trade mission to visit China. Back in February 1921, prior to the conflagration in Mongolia, Chinese official from the Peking government, Chen Kuan-ping, visited Moscow “with a report that ‘the Chinese Government in principle expressed agreement to the arrival of a Soviet representative’”.<sup>2</sup> Alexander K. Paikes, heading the first fully accredited mission from Moscow, arrived at China in December 1921. While Yurin proposed the principle of mutual justice to settle the issue of the Chinese Eastern Railway with due consideration, Alexander K. Paikes changed wording on different occasions. Upon arrival in China, Paikes superficially claimed that the purpose of his trip was “the return of the Chinese Eastern Railway to China without financial obligation or any other condition beyond a promise that she would not dispose of it to any other power”.<sup>3</sup> On May 22<sup>nd</sup>, 1922, Paikes emphasized to Chinese foreign minister Yan Huiqing that the essence of Chicherin’s statement or Karakhan’s manifestos meant a revision, not a full annulment of all Tsarist treaties. On June 27<sup>th</sup>, Paikes changed tune to state that all Soviet statements and manifestos were still valid but new treaties must be concluded before the annulment of Tsarist treaties.

The Soviets, in late June 1922, ordered to dispatch Adolf A. Joffe to China as plenipotentiary. On August 12<sup>th</sup>, 1922, the Adolf A. Joffe delegation arrived in China for the purpose of establishing official relations with China. Maring, who failed to get the five Chinese Communist central committee members to agree to joining the KMT party at the First West Lake Meeting (March-April 1922) and had to leave Shanghai for Moscow on April 24<sup>th</sup> to have the Comintern issue directives, came back to China together with Joffe, with their visa sanitized at the Representative Office of the Soviet Union stationed in Berlin. The Chinese government in Peking, following the rapprochement lead of the powers, began to enter talks with the Soviets who already made three declarations to renounce unequal treaties and return the Chinese Eastern Railway; however, the Chinese government had forfeited the golden opportunity to strike a better agreement with Soviet Russia while the latter was in earlier years desperate to make concessions in order to break the international isolation. On August 25<sup>th</sup> and September 2<sup>nd</sup>, Joffe twice requested with foreign minister Wellington Koo for commencing Sino-Soviet talks. China, at a national council meeting, made a decision to put up preconditions such as the resolution of issues related to Mongolia and the Chinese Eastern Railway before recognizing the Soviet Union. Wu Peifu declined Joffe’s demand to replace Wellington Koo with someone else and further claimed to Joffe that he was ready to send an army to Mongolia to recover the lost territory. On

<sup>2</sup> Allen Suss Whiting, *Soviet policies in China, 1917-1924*, Stanford University Press, Jun 1, 1968, p. 167.

<sup>3</sup> *The Soviet Offer to China of 1919*

Author(s): Allen S. Whiting Source: *The Far Eastern Quarterly*, Vol. 10, No. 4 (Aug., 1951), pp. 355-364.  
Published by: Association for Asian Studies.

September 27, Joffe wrote to the Soviet leadership to state that some flexible interpretation of Karakhan manifestos could make Soviet Russia appear just an ordinary imperialist country. While publicly insisting that “the declarations of 1919 and 1920 merely laid down a basis for negotiations and carried no legal consequences in and of themselves” and “stressing the brotherhood of Russian and Chinese revolutionaries”, Joffe, a veteran diplomat at the Treaty of Brest-Litovsk, privately stressed to the Peking government as to “Russian interests in the railway zone”, and further on November 3, 1922 “warned that ‘as a matter of fact, the Russian government alone has the right practically to interfere, being more than any other government concerned with the future of this railroad, since it was built with the Russian people's funds and is Russian property until Russia, of her own free will, decides to confer elsewhere her right of ownership’”. On the 5<sup>th</sup> anniversary date of the Soviet revolution, Joffe relayed a message demanding with China that Soviet Russia’s “interest in the question of the Chinese Eastern Railway will be understood and satisfied by China”.

The Soviet’s hardening of its stance had the cause and effect in the ascension of its bargaining power in the international community. With the United States, France, Italy, and other countries ending the armed intervention in the Russian Far East, Japan was forced to end its holdout to withdraw from Siberia. Further, Japan was to give up Qingdao under the pressure of the 1921-1922 Washington Conference and agreed to allow China to take back the Qingdao-Ji’nan Railway within 15 years via redemption at a price of 3200万银元. Further, as concluded by Bruce A. Ellema, with the Anglo-Japanese alliance abrogated by the Washington conference, “the checks and balances by which the Anglo-Japanese alliance had formerly opposed Russian expansionism in China disappeared altogether, and were not replaced by a similar system to control renewed Soviet expansion.”<sup>4</sup> In October 1922, the powers cancelled the international co-management over the Chinese Eastern Railway which effectively paved the way for the control of the railway to the Soviets from the Inter-Allied technical board. Jacques Davtian, a Soviet emissary who could be possibly a Comintern agent of French origin, was sent to Manchuria for talks with Zhang Zuolin in regards to the Chinese Eastern Railway. Under the pressure of the Sino-Japanese settlement of the Shandong railway matter which was in the spirits of the Washington Conference, Jacques Davtian tentatively struck a 50-50 sharing agreement with Zhang Zuolin, which Stalin subsequently struck down.<sup>5</sup> It was in this circumstance that the Soviets contemplated an invasion of Manchuria in the fall of 1922, about which P.A. Kobozev commented to Maring in February 1923 that “three months ago it would have been possible to occupy the railway but now the good opportunity has already been lost.”

Hearing of Chicherin’s scheme to invade Manchuria, Sun Yat-sen on December 6<sup>th</sup>, 1922, telegraphed Lenin direct to diffuse the situation, claiming that he could manage to persuade Zhang Zuolin into cooperation with the Soviets. Back in June 1922, Chen Jiongming’s rebellion against Sun Yat-sen in Canton tilted Sun Yat-sen’s focus back to seeking alliance with the

---

<sup>4</sup> Diplomacy and deception: the secret history of Sino-Soviet diplomatic relations, 1917-1927  
Bruce A. Ellema. M.E. Sharpe, 1997. P. 120.

<sup>5</sup> The Davtian Agreement, which was destroyed and missing from the Soviet archives, purportedly allowed the Chinese government to manage the railway alone, gave China the right to buy back all stock ownership within five years, granted the Soviet Union and the Soviet Far Eastern Republic to participate in the railway operation prior to full redemption of the stock ownership, and assigned all debt and bond ownership to the Chinese government.

Soviets in lieu of some prior agreements to sell China's islands to Japan in exchange for weaponry and funding. While seeking asylum on a warship in the Pearl River, Sun Yat-sen authorized a letter to be relayed to Chicherin through Sergei Dalin [who In April 1922, as Soviet representative of the Young Communist International, visited Sun Yat-sen in Canton], claiming that he finally realized that Soviet Russia was China's true friends. In Shanghai, Marin, who returned to China with Joffe, in the name of Joffe, visited Sun Yat-sen in August. One month later, Joffe sent military attaché A.I. Gekker [who could be of the same Dutch origin as Maring] to see Sun Yat-sen for discussions on military alliance in and to the northern and western areas of China, followed by the return visits of Zhang Ji to Peking for seeing Joffe as Sun Yat-sen's representative. Among Sun's proposals would be a request for the Soviet military support in invading Xinjiang to defeat the 4000 Chinese troops stationed there in order to establish a regime in Chinese Turkestan, in exchange for which a tripartite mining venture among China, Soviet Russia and Germany could be launched to exploit the resources in the western Chinese territories, in the form of a iron and steel works and an ordinance plant. Sun Yat-sen, against the Peking government's declaration of war at Germany and Austria, had been advocating for an alliance with Germany since 1917, a KMT line that fit in with the secret 1922-33 Soviet Red Army-Reichswehr collaboration in officer training, chemical warfare development, airforce and navy armament rebuild and military maneuvers inside of the Soviet Union<sup>6</sup> and that was adopted by Chiang Kai-shek from 1926-7 onward as an alternative to the KMT-Soviet alliance. In November and December, Sun repeatedly explored with Joffe about obtaining the Soviet military aid, backing down from a request for the direct interference by the Soviet Red Army to that of the Soviet military assistance through the route of Ulan Bator, with a proposal to send a contingent to Mongolia where the Soviets could help to organize and train three mixed brigades of 6000-10000 soldiers each. Sun Yat-sen, replying to Joffe in regards to the strategical position of Canton, acknowledged the geographical disadvantage for its proximity to the British citadel at Hongkong but insisted that he could not abandon it for some unspecified special reasons. In regards to the Soviet scheme and "a plan to invade Manchuria during the fall of 1922, in order to take control of the Chinese Eastern Railway by force", Joffe dissuaded it on the ground that Sun Yat-sen was not "an official figure of the Central Chinese state" who could be used as a figurehead to create a pretext to interfere in China's internal affairs by invading China, i.e., Manchuria or Chinese Turkestan per Bruce A. Elleman.<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup> The Soviet armaments industry Psychology Press, Nov 1, 1993

By Ulrich Albrecht, Randolph Nikutta. Hitler in summer 1933 "abruptly ordered discontinuation of all collaboration with the USSR, including removal of all German units from Soviet soil." Evolving on top of Soviet purchase of weapons and military equipment from Germany since 1918, the Soviets and Germans reached the "Rapallo accord in 1922 about their mutual interest in chemical weapons", beginning more sophisticated military collaboration extending from chemical warfare to development of military airplanes, navy submarines and rockets etc, as well as training of German officers and cadets as well as frequent German military exercises and maneuvers on Soviet oil, with participation by the Soviet Red Army. Pp. 63-64.

<sup>7</sup> Manchurian Railways and the Opening of China: An International History

By Bruce A. Elleman, Stephen Kotkin. M.E. Sharpe, Nov 30, 2009. p 65

Secret communications between the Comintern representatives in China even referred to a plan to invade Manchuria during the fall of 1922, in order to take control of the Chinese Eastern Railway by force. Joffe to Maring - Nov 7 1922 - as long as Dr. Sun is not an official figure of the Central Chinese state, we cannot, ..., attempt an occupation in China'. Maring reported about his conversation with P.A. Kobozev - Feb 1923 - Three months ago it would have been possible to occupy the railway but now the good opportunity has already been lost."25

Maring, together with Joffe, i.e., Paikes' successor, were responsible for changing the Comintern's "Irkutsk line" to full cooperation with Sun Yat-sen. The Comintern's "Irkutsk line", led by Vladimir Vilenskii (Sibiriakov), was to seek cooperation with Wu Peifu and have the Peking government recognize the Soviet Far Eastern Republic and strike deals on Outer Mongolia and the Chinese Eastern Railway etc. Maring, who helped to found a Chinese Labour Secretariat in August 1921 but ridiculed it in 1923 as a "Secretariat without real workers" because the Chinese Communists could not "go to the workers under the communist banner", believed that the infant Chinese Communist "members must remain in the KMT", while the labor organization would take place under the Profintern's banner [not Comintern's banner], "thus creating the basis for a communist mass party" per Tony Saich in "The origins of the first United Front in China: the role of Sneevliet (alias Maring)". On August 17<sup>th</sup>, 1922, at the Second West Lake Meeting [that followed the July 16<sup>th</sup> CCP 2<sup>nd</sup> Congress meeting], Maring forced through the July 18<sup>th</sup> Comintern presidium's directive 《共产国际执委会给其驻中国南方代表的指令》, which was brought to China on a shirt he wore, for the CCP to join the KMT, with emphasis on maintaining independence in thoughts and ideology in the motley KMT party, readying itself for split from the KMT party should schism grow too wide in the process of development, and committing to support for the bourgeoisie and handicraft factions of the KMT. The other Comintern directive was to have the CCP central committee "remove its seat to Canton (Guangzhou) immediately after receiving this note and do all its work in close contact with Comrade Philipp (Sneevliet)" in order to implement the strategic shift of focusing on the South and conducting work through the KMT. On August 25<sup>th</sup>, 1922, Maring, in the company of Li Dazhao [who helped to convert secretary Chen Duxiu to the Soviet scheme], visited Sun Yat-sen in Shanghai to have the KMT director-general keep the original promise to take in the communists. Sun Yat-sen, ecstatic over the prospect of the Soviet aid as hinted in Joffe's letter, bought into the communist "bloc-within strategy" against prevalent objection among the KMT members and leaders. To diffuse the internal opposition, Sun Yat-sen, who claimed that the KMT party had severe anemia and in need of blood fusion, arranged communist secretary Chen Duxiu to the Yong'an Restaurant to meet KMT leaders, including 张继、居正、汪精卫、戴传贤、谢持. Chen Duxiu excused the communist party from the accusation that communists such as Tan Pingshan and Chen Gongbo, who published a newspaper for rebel Chen Jiongming in Canton, did not represent himself and the communist party, and managed to alleviate the anxiety of the KMT leaders towards communists, which paved the way for the ultimate meeting between Sun Yat-sen and Joffe in January 1924. In Peking, after the 2<sup>nd</sup> communist party meeting at the West Lake of Hangzhou in August 1922, Li Dazhao, who was the communist party's true founder, immediately implemented Maring's broad united front directive, and visited the Nanyuan army barracks to instigate Feng Yuxiang, an old acquaintance from the 1911 revolution, and made special arrangement for Joffe, the Soviet plenipotentiary extraordinaire, to meet with Feng Yuxiang whose army was already permeated with pro-Soviet YMCA agents since 1921.

Like predecessor Paikes, Joffe failed to make any progress in the Soviet efforts at establishing diplomacy with China. Further, Joffe, who categorically denied the validity of the Soviet offer in Karakhan manifestos to transfer the railway without compensation as well as refused to make promise as to evacuating Soviet troops from Mongolia, alienated the Chinese, which in Elleman's opinion was one integral step of the Soviet scheme to transform the Karakhan

manifestos to null and void. After failing to get Wu Peifu, the de facto military ruler in North China, to agree on a joint south-north government that was brokered by the Soviets as well as failing to achieve any breakthrough in negotiations with Wellington Koo on Mongolia and the Chinese Eastern Railway, Joffe began to pay more and more attention to tacking on Sun Yat-sen to exert pressure on the northern government. On December 12th, Joffe reported to Moscow that Sun Yat-sen's KMT should be utilized as a strong force in moving the Soviet agenda in China. In a mid December report, Maring (Henk Sneevliet) and A.A. Joffe further co-authored an outline of work in China, entitled "Concerning our work in the Colonies and Semi-Colonial Countries in general and in China", advocating for a Soviet policy towards China that should not create an impression of imperialism. Joffe, who might lean more towards the Comintern interest than Soviet Russia's interest, questioned whether it would be more appropriate to recognize the revolutionary government in South China so as not to appear to be acting in the same fashion as imperialists to sabotage the northern government. On January 4<sup>th</sup>, 1923, the Soviet politburo, with Leon Trotsky's endorsement, passed the decision to support Joffe's policy of full support for KMT. Though, the Soviet politburo initially ignored Joffe's petition to provide funding to Sun Yat-sen in the amount of 2 million US dollars per month, up to ten months. When the news came that pro-Sun Yunnan provincial armies retook Canton on January 10<sup>th</sup>, 1923, the Soviets immediately authorized Joffe to travel to Shanghai for seeing Sun Yat-sen before the latter's return to power. Unable to make gain with the Peking government, Joffe flew south to liaison with rivalries of the Peking government, and in late January issued a Sun-Joffe declaration to exert pressure on the Peking government.<sup>8</sup>

In a outrage over Sun Yat-sen's declaration on Outer Mongolian and the Chinese Eastern Railway, Wu Peifu, who was previously favored by Soviets of the Comintern's "Irkutsk line" such as Vladimir Vilenskii (Sibiriakov) and made special arrangement for Li Dazhao's communists to control North China's railways as railway inspectors under transportation minister Gao Enhong 高恩洪, ordered to ban the 国际劳工组织 Labor Secretariat's February 1<sup>st</sup> launch of the Peiping-Hankow Railway's general labor union at Zhengzhou, which resulted in the bloody crackdown on February 7, 1923, as a result of the communists' decision not to back down. The communist Labor Secretariat 中国劳动组合书记部, which Maring called by a secretariat without workers, later in 1924 relocated to Shanghai from Peking, and in the cloak of the KMT-CCP collaboration and by means of hijacking the KMT's Shanghai Executive Bureau, took control of the KMT's Shanghai Federation of Labor Unions 上海工团联合会, which KMT labor department director Ma Chaojun organized on the May day of 1923 by consolidating over thirty-two Shanghai unions, including the sailors' union, machinist unions, textile unions, and the union of the Nanyang Brothers' Tobacco Company. In the aftermath of the February 1923 crackdown on Peiping-Hankow Railway workers, Maring convened the Third West Lake Meeting during which Maring pushed through a resolution to allow selected communist party leaders to join the KMT party. Zhang Guotao, for his opposition to the Soviet direction to have communists join the KMT, was labeled a bad apple who ran a small faction within the party,

---

<sup>8</sup> Trotsky endorsed Joffe's decision. Joffe's five-member team left for Shanghai where they met Sun Yat-sen. On January 26, 1923, Joffe and Sun issued a 'Joffe-Sun Joint Statement' in which Joffe agreed, per Harold Isaacs that "conditions do not exist here for the successful establishment of Communism or Socialism," that "the chief and immediate aim of China is the achievement of national union and national independence." Liao Zhongkai later went to Japan for drafting the cooperation paper with Joffe one more time. On Jan 29th, Sun Yat-sen completed the writing of China's revolutionary history per KMT records.

over which Li Dazhao, who was retroactively added to the central committee of the CCP 2<sup>nd</sup> congress, privately soothed his faithful communism follower not to take it seriously as their Chinese comrades did not believe in so. With the help of Qu Qiubai, a Moscow returnee, Maring a few months later pushed through the Comintern's May 1923 directives to have the CCP collectively [no longer selectively] enter the KMT as a bloc-within at the CCP's third congress that was held in June 1923. Zhang Guotao was kicked out of the 3<sup>rd</sup> central executive committee for opposition to the Soviet direction to join the KMT and Mao Tse-tung, whose Hunan group did not enjoy the provincial status among the communist party cells in 1920, was favored by Maring to enter the politburo to be a secretarial secretary to assist with secretary-general Chen Duxiu. Among the five 2<sup>nd</sup> congress central committee members, only Chen Duxiu and Chen Hesun stayed on to be the 3<sup>rd</sup> congress central committee members.

In February 1923, with a letter of introduction from Sun Yat-sen, Maring, under Davtian's order in Joffe's absence from Peking, visited Zhang Zuolin in Mukden as a German news agency reporter [[Authorization for Sneevliet as correspondent for the Far East of the Comintern and The International Press Correspondence, 24 July 1922. The authorization is signed by Karl Radek, member of the EKKI Presidium.]], but failed to obtain concession on the Chinese Eastern Railway. Maring's feedback was that Zhang Zuolin was more efficient and democratic than Wu Peifu; that Zhang Zuolin had given asylum to Russian White refugees out of humanitarian consideration; and that the Soviet demand for railway co-management could work against the Soviet anti-imperialism doctrine. Even with Sun Yat-sen weighing in, the Soviets failed to extract seven seats out of ten on the proposed railway board. From February to March, Trotsky (Lev Davidovich Bronshtein) discussed with Red Army commander-in-chief Lev Kamenev [[加米涅夫]] about how and where to help Sun Yat-sen to build a revolutionary army, Trotsky, on March 8th, had the Soviet politburo procedurally agree to deliver an aid package of 2 million Mexican dollars to Sun Yat-sen, in principle agree to be feasible for a revolutionary base to be built in western China in addition to dispatching military and political advisers.<sup>9</sup> However, delivery of the actual aid was dependent on Sun Yat-sen's sending a team to Moscow, with more strings to be attached later, such as request for Sun's exertion of his personal influence in getting Manchuria agree to a Soviet majority control over the railway. In late March, Stalin, at a politburo meeting, struck down the Davtian's 50-50 Agreement, and issued instructions not to assign important missions to Jacques Davtian in the future. While it was ordered to nullify the Davtian-Zhang Zuolin Agreement, Stalin and the Soviet politburo cunningly instructed Soviet agents on the field not to create an impression upon the Mukden grouping that Zhang Zuolin's points had been negated.<sup>10</sup> In May, Joffe from Tokyo officially notified Sun Yat-sen of the aid package of 2 million gold rubles as well as the pledge to provide 8000 Japanese rifles to have the nationalist party (KMT) set up military bases or academies in northern and western China [which in Sun's view included Mongolia but could mean Inner Mongolia according to the Soviets'

---

<sup>9</sup> Manchurian Railways and the Opening of China: An International History

By Bruce A. Elleman, Stephen Kotkin

M.E. Sharpe, Nov 30, 2009 p 66

Offer included: two million gold rubles, military unit -trained in Northwest China, 8000 Japanese rifles, 15 machine-guns, 4 Oriska guns and two armored cars.

<sup>10</sup> Jacques Davtian, who participated in the Manuilskii Mission post-1917 Soviet revolution, together with Dmitri Manuilskii and Inessa Armand, visited Paris in late 1910s. Later in late 1930s, Davtian, later at one time Soviet ambassador to Poland, together with wife Maksakova, a beautiful Russian prima donna, fell victims to Stalin's purge.

psyche], but with a precondition that Sun had to help Joffe in pressuring Zhang Zuolin on the matter of making concessions on the Chinese Eastern Railway. While expressing apology for falling short of Sun's objective of equipment for an army of 100,000, Joffe wanted Maring to emphasize the importance of the Soviet aid in return gratitude for which the Chinese party was expected to accommodate Soviet demands on Outer Mongolia and the Chinese Eastern Railway. Sun Yat-sen followed up by sending Wang Ching-wei and Zhang Qun to Mukden but the two emissaries failed to have Zhang Zuolin support the Soviet Union "to regain seven of the ten seats on the CER's managing board of directors" per Bruce A. Elleman and Stephen Kotkin in "Manchurian Railways and the Opening of China: An International History".

In January, the [[EKKI]] Presidium at the Comintern headquarters made a decision to change Marin's role from that of a Comintern [[ECCI]] representative to that of a third commissar at the newly-organized Comintern Far Eastern Bureau (FEB) in Vladivostok and that of a Comintern representative to the Third CCP Congress to be held in Canton. On March 27<sup>th</sup>, which was after Stalin's negation of the Davtian Agreement, Voitinsky replied to Maring from Vladivostok to explain that he had not made a decision to send money to Maring as he did not comprehend Joffe's telegram in regards to a strong demand to have Maring stay on in China. Meantime, Voitinsky wired to G. Safarov [the responsible person for the Eastern Section of the Comintern] at the Comintern headquarters to suggest that Maring could stay on till after the close of the CCP third congress and that Maring should be cautioned against unconditional support for the KMT, should not support Sun Yat-sen's efforts to spend money on governor-generals for sake of utilizing those southern militarists' armies, and should sever relations with northern faction leaders like Zhang Zuolin and Duan Qirui etc. On April 4<sup>th</sup>, Safarov recommended to the Comintern presidium to revoke Maring's mission. From Canton, Maring on 31 May 1923 wrote to Joffe, Davtian and Zinoviev to suggest that "it would be best to begin the [financial] support [for Sun Yat-sen] after ensuring that it will not be used for the [warlord] military in the south. The [KMT] reorganization plan, designed here by [communist secretary] Chen Duxiu and myself and discussed with Sun and adopted by him, suggests to use one third of the aid for reorganization of the revolutionary nationalist party and for anti-imperialist propaganda, the rest should serve to create a military organization in the north or west" per Tony Saich in "The origins of the first United Front in China: the role of Sneevliet (alias Maring)". On the same day, Marin, who had not heard from N. Bukharin since writing a letter in March, complained direct to N. Bukharin that he had not received financial payment for some time; that some people at the Comintern [[ECCI]] had divulged internal discords to the Chinese communist [i.e., Zhang Guotao] who returned to China to spread the news to cause him trouble in having the CCP ally with and join the KMT; and that Sun Yat-sen had expressed wish to have him join the KMT party to be in charge of the KMT reorganization directly, a role that could solve the problem of financial insolvency he was experiencing, which he suggested he would consider taking should the Comintern [[ECCI]] retain his role as a [[ECCI]] representative to China. On June 20<sup>th</sup>, Maring expressed his disappointment to Joffe and Davtian over the silence from the Comintern. On the same day, Maring complained to Zinoviev, N. Bukharin and Karl Radek about the misinformation of left, middle and right factions' categorizing at the Comintern that some young cadres at the Comintern Far Eastern Bureau had divulged to Zhang Guotao. About one month later, Maring wrote to Joffe and Davtian that he could not continue on with life while receiving no funds but newsletters from home. Back in Moscow, at the July 1923 politburo meeting, Trotsky criticized Stalin for endorsing the CCP bloc-within strategy, claiming that cooperation

with the KMT bourgeoisie party was a betrayal to the working class and was equivalent to being Menshevik. The Trotsky-Stalin struggle was to last through 1927 and beyond, when the CCP-KMT collaboration finally collapsed in China.

Sun Yat-sen repeatedly wired to Joffe to have the Soviets deliver the first tranche of the aid as promised; however, Joffe wanted Sun Yat-sen to express goodwill by extricating himself from the wars in southern China so as to divert some attention to assistance with the Soviets on the Sino-Soviet negotiations on the Chinese Eastern Railway. With the Soviets procrastinating on delivering the promised aid, Sun Yat-sen continued dangling with the British in Hongkong through famed compradors such as Wu Chaoshu as well as scheming with Japan to sell China's rights in exchange for funding. Sun Yat-sen in February 1923 met British consul general and Minister Sir Ronald Macleay in Shanghai and in late February was invited to lunch by the governor of the Hongkong colony while en route to Canton. It would be "in the autumn of 1923" that "Sun Yat-sen found himself forced to activate the Soviet option and commit himself to cooperation with Moscow" when he failed on September 5 and October 3 to have the diplomatic corps resume funding of the 13.7% of surplus customs revenue, which was an arrangement of 1919 for the southern government to share surplus revenues with the Peking government, including "arrears that he calculated brought the sum owed to 12.6 million Chinese dollars" per Marie-Claire Bergère and Janet Lloyd in "Sun Yat-sen By Marie-Claire Bergère, Janet Lloyd". The sailing of foreign warships to Canton to demonstrate force against Sun Yat-sen over the latter's threat to take custody of the Canton customs led Chen Youren (Eugene Chen) to declare that the powers forced Sun Yat-sen into shaking the friendship hand of Soviet Russia.<sup>11</sup>

On March 1<sup>st</sup>, 1923, Sun Yat-sen organized the headquarters' command of the Northern Expedition Army in the name of "marshal", a post conferred upon by the minority parliamentarians who assembled in Canton, and declared a policy of alliance with Zhang Zuolin and Duan Qirui against Cao Kun and Wu Peifu's Peking government.<sup>12</sup> Meantime, Sun Yat-sen

<sup>11</sup> On March 21st 1923, Sun Yat-sen was restored his 'grand marshal' post in Canton.

However, Sun Yat-sen was facing financial hardship as a result of Chen Jiongming's hijacking of the vault as well as increased burden for support of Guangxi-Yunnan armies. Sun Yat-sen did not forget to recall Chiang Kai-shek, but Chiang Kai-shek was too busy with stock trading to report to Canton. To solve financial crisis, Sun Yat-sen resorted to threats against foreign legations in taking over Canton customs office for withholding surplus funds in the spring of 1923. Sun Yat-sen's resorting to Canton surplus withholding would lead to the 17 foreign warships' charge at White Swan Pond. British Admiral Leveson led the fleet in sailing along the Perl River in Canton. Foreign Minister Chen Youren, in a news conference attended by Reuters and numerous international reporters, claimed that Western gunboat policy compelled Sun Yat-sen into shaking the "friendship hand" of USSR. Chen Jieru memoirs claimed that Sun Yat-sen's news broadcast was merely a "threat" in winning over support from "democratic countries", not an ultimate shift of political stand grounds. USSR/Comintern alliance

<sup>12</sup> Back in Dec 1922, Sun Yat-sen obtained the support of Guangxi Army General Liu Zhenhuan in expelling Chen Jiongming's Guangdong Army from Canton. General Liu Zhenhuan, in cooperation with Yunnan Province Army General Yang Ximin, attacked Canton on Jan 5<sup>th</sup> 1923. (Li Zongren memoirs stated that in the summer of 1922, Sun Yat-sen called upon Yunnan & Guangxi troops in fighting Chen Jiongming, and that in Dec, departing from Wuzhou & Hexian, Shen Hongying, together with Liu Zhenhuan and Yang Ximin, expelled Chen Jiongming from Canton.) On Jan 16<sup>th</sup> of 1923, Sun Yat-sen's army, comprising of Dian-jun and Gui-jun, defeated Chen Jiongming and recovered Canton. Chen Jiongming fled to Huizhou. Dian-jun and Gui-jun chased their way towards Huizhou and destroyed bulk of the Yue-jun army. Xu Chongzhi was empowered with rebuilding Yue-jun army by absorbing the stranded Chen Jiongming soldiers as well as recalling the troops which had retreated to Fujian at the time of Chen Jiongming rebellion.

continued his twenty-year scheme to sell pieces of China, which he did not legally possess, to Japan in exchange for funding. Upon returning to power in Canton in spring 1923, Sun Yat-sen, against the objection of the Hainandao Natives' Societies in Peking and Hongkong, attempted to renew the dealing with a "Japan-China Forest, Mining & Industrial Company" (日华林矿工业公司), a contract he struck with Japan on February 5<sup>th</sup>, 1922, to sell the rights of development of and the fishing right around all Chinese islands from the Amoy coastline to Hainandao as well as the preferential mining right in Guangxi in exchange for 20,000 guns, 5 million rounds of ammunition, 72 artillery pieces with 15,000 shells, 120 machineguns with ammunition, and 5 million yen, with Japanese restriction to hold back 4 million yens and two-thirds of weaponry pending the successful control of one other province among Jiangxi, Fujian and Hunan by Sun Yat-sen's southern army.<sup>13</sup>

Mikhail Markovich Borodin, as a Soviet representative, was dispatched to Canton as a replacement for Maring. Knowing that Joffe was recalled and Karakhan/Borodin would come instead, Maring, who became disillusioned over the KMT reorganization as a result of Sun Yat-sen's demand for obtaining immediate financial aid as well as emphasis on concentration all efforts on stabilizing the Guangdong province militarily, declined the Soviet offer to stay in Canton as the future Soviet consul or as a [[Rosta]] reporter. Shortly after the close of the CCP's third congress in late June, Maring had the new communist Central Committee members, Chen Duxiu, Li Dazhao, Cai Hesen, Tan Pingshan and Mao Zedong, etc al., write to Sun Yat-sen with a call to end military actions in Canton and to go to Shanghai instead to launch a national conference and lead a national movement per Tony Saich in "The origins of the first United Front in China: the role of Sneevliet (alias Maring)". In August 1923, Maring, en route of return to Moscow, unexpectedly ran into Borodin in Harbin. At the same time, Chiang Kai-shek and Wang Dengyun 王登云, in the company of communists Zhang Tailei and Shen Dingyi who were added at Maring's suggestion, departed for Moscow to strike an agreement to build a military base in Ulan Bator or Dihua [[Urumqi]], with a swear to return victorious as if he was a general on a remote campaign in ancient times. In September, Sun Yat-sen wired to Karakhan concur on the need to prioritizing the anti-imperialism work which was a Soviet theme that the KMT party members consistently opposed for fear of alienating the powers. In October 1923, Borodin took over Maring's role in supporting Sun Yat-sen and Chiang Kai-shek's KMT government as well as maintaining the CCP-KMT alliance. As a multiple-prong tactic, Borodin, who was touted as a trust-worthy representative of Karakhan himself, officially started working for Sun Yat-sen's southern government as an adviser in late 1923 and reorganized the KMT party on basis of the Soviet systems in early 1924.

Chiang Kai-shek entered the Soviet Union on August 25<sup>th</sup>, [[Chiang Kai-shek about sending a delegation to Moscow for further talks on collaboration]] and in early September met with Georgii-Chicherin, Janis Rudzutaks., E. M. Sklyanskii. Sergey Sergeyevich Kamenev, Anatoly Vasilyevich Lunacharsky and Leon-Trotsky. Chiang Kai-shek, at the request of Sklyanskii, Efraim Markovich at a meeting on September 9<sup>th</sup>, submitted in early October three proposals, including a 8,200- character military plan termed the "new future of the Chinese revolution"

---

<sup>13</sup> The contract with the "Japan-China Forest, Mining & Industrial Company" (日华林矿工业公司) was confiscated by Ye Ju, an officer under Chen Jiongming, during the June 1922 mutiny against Sun Yat-sen. The Hainandao Natives' Society in Peking had first protested with Chen Jiongming about Sun Yat-sen's deal to sell Hainandao's rights in the winter of 1920.

(〈中国革命之新前途〉), which was a plan to seek the Soviet assistance to establish a recruiting base south of Ulan Bator but with various options laid out, including the organization of a strike force at the temporary base at Ulan Bator and the organization of a reversed army at the permanent base in Dihua (Urumqi), and an alternative option to seek a base at Ulan Bator in lieu of two as proposed. The plan, reiterating Sun Yat-sen's discussion with Joffe in regards to training an army of three mixed brigades, called for the Soviets to provide 15,000-24,000 rifles, 12-18 artillery pieces, 1500-3000 horses and mules, 6-10 planes and 50-300 trucks. The Soviets immediately consulted with Karakhan in Peking, and Karakhan on October 6<sup>th</sup> asked Borodin to relay to Sun Yat-sen in Canton a message to the effect that the KMT reorganization must be implemented first before there could be any talk of military plans, that the Soviets' primary task was to consolidate positions in Manchuria and resolve the issue of the Chinese Eastern Railway, and that Sun Yat-sen had to know that his delegation in Moscow could not achieve anything without the participation of Karakhan himself. Trotsky, on basis of Karakhan's feedback, ordered to relay an opinion to Chiang Kai-shek that the KMT had a long term task to reorganize itself while any military plan or request for the Soviet military aid had to be deferred till the European situation (i.e., the communist uprising in Germany on October 23) got clarified. On October 21<sup>st</sup>, Georgii-Chicherin blatantly told Chiang Kai-shek that the plan to set up a base in Mongolia was not feasible since the Mongols had fear for the Chinese. Chiang Kai-shek became disillusioned upon finding out that the Soviets had changed mind as to what Maring and Joffe originally offered in helping the KMT to launch a military base in western and northern China, i.e., in Mongolia. After receiving Sun Yat-sen's wire stating that Borodin had begun to deliver the promise that Joffe made earlier, Chiang Kai-shek re-collected himself to write a letter to Chicherin about the difference of the KMT as a revolutionary party advocating freedom and autonomy on behalf of the Mongols in contrast with the warlord government of China. On November 11<sup>th</sup>, Efraim Markovich Sklyanskii reemphasized to Chiang Kai-shek that KMT would need a few years to focus on the political work. On November 27<sup>th</sup>, Trotsky told Chiang Kai-shek that the KMT should consider launching attacks at the Peking government from within the Chinese territory instead of from Mongolia.

While Chiang Kai-shek was en route of return to China in disappointment, Chicherin wrote to Sun Yat-sen to emphasize the point that the Mongols, the Tibetans, and the people in western China should clearly know that the KMT support their self-determination, and that the KMT should not contemplate on launching wars from those territories. Later in March 1924, Chiang Kai-shek, in an admonition letter to pro-Soviet colleague Liao Zhongkai, summarized the Soviet policies to mean that Manchuria, Mongolia, Tibet and West China were already treated by the Soviets as their satellite soviet, the China proper had to be part of the Soviet design as well. Chiang Kai-shek's military plan could have become a blueprint for the Soviets to muse in providing military aid to Feng Yuxiang's National People's Army to capsize the Manchurian regime in 1925. . From late 1923 to early 1924, Maring kept correspondence with Sun Yat-sen and Chiang Kai-shek in hoping to return to China to continue his unfinished work in vain. In April 1924, Maring, who singlehandedly sowed the seeds of disasters in the twenty-century China, returned to Holland, and in 1927 quit the Comintern and the Dutch Communist Party before launching a Dutch Revolutionary Socialist Party two years later.

Though Maring was recalled to Moscow over his rightist propensity on the matter of full reliance on the KMT, the KMT-CCP collaboration began in earnest when Borodin arrived in Canton in

October. With Trotsky's financial support and endorsement, Borodin brought 120,000 (?) rifles and 2 million Mexican dollars to Sun Yat-sen's KMT in Canton and contributed to the so-called China's "Da Ge-ming" (i.e. "Grand Revolution"), also termed the 'First Revolutionary Civil War' by the CCP, a campaign that would unite China under Sun Yat-sen's KMT government.<sup>14</sup> The new Soviet directive for Chinese Communists was to conduct work both inside of the KMT and outside of the KMT as pointed out by Safarov on April 4<sup>th</sup> 1923, instead of Maring's singular emphasis on communists' working from inside of the KMT. On November 24<sup>th</sup>, 1923, the CCP convened the first central executive committee meeting of the third congress members, and passed the Act on the Plan for Conducting the National People's Movement

《国民运动进行计划决议案》, with a stipulation that communists shall stay a secret cell inside of the KMT. On November 28, 1923, the Comintern's Executive Committee passed a resolution on the national liberation movement in China and the Kuomintang matter, which was to a blueprint for Borodin to use to make a new interpretation of the Three People's Principles. At the end of November 1923, Deng Zeru and about ten or so Cantonese members of the KMT raised objection with Sun Yat-sen as to allowing communists to join the KMT party, claiming that communists could utilize the body of KMT to make the soul of CCP out of the reorganization and pointing to communist secretary Ch'en Tu-hsiu as formerly a favorite of rebel Ch'en Chiung-ming. Owing to internal dissension, Sun Yat-sen managed to have Borodin compromise on the Soviet demand on making anti-imperialism a top item on the KMT agenda while agreeing on the theme of struggle against militarism per Marie-Claire Bergère and Janet Lloy. In January 1924, the KMT, which claimed to possess hundreds of thousands of members, convened its first congress in Canton

In June 1924, Deng Zeru, Zhang Ji, and Xie Chi et al. proposed an act of impeachment against the Communist Party and the "expulsion of the dangerous allies", which led to heated debate within the KMT. The trigger came from the unscrupulous support that Chinese Communists exerted to the Sino-Soviet Agreement signed in Peking in May, as well as "their propaganda urging the ratification of the Sino-Russian treaty", including and not restricted to restoring to the Soviets the 50% control of the Chinese Eastern Railway prior to the convention of Sino-Soviet conference to stipulate new treaties to replace the Tsarist treaties, as well as the "discovery of internal communist documents that had appeared in the Journal of the Socialist Youth Corps and that were explicit about the details of cooperation with the Guomindang" per Marie-Claire Bergère and Janet Lloy. Some of the KMT leaders openly charged that the Soviet scheme to have the Chinese Communists join the Chinese Nationalist Party and the cooperation with the Soviet Union could make the KMT lose the original position, and even become the Communist Party. The Kuomintang Central Executive Committee on July 7<sup>th</sup>, 1924, under Hu Hanmin's residing, had a meeting to resolve issues including Deng Zeru's impeachment motion, made a

---

<sup>14</sup> Michael Borodin, a rep of the Politburo of the Communist Party of the Soviet Union, came to serve as an adviser to Sun Yat-sen in the fall of 1923. Borodin, being a USSR rep in Canton from Oct 1923 to July 1927, would now take over Maring's role in supporting Sun Yat-sen and Chiang Kai-shek's KMT government as well as maintaining the CCP-KMT alliance. With KMT & CCP hence became a tricky issue. Borodin, not a rep for the Comintern, was to reorganize the KMT into "a disciplined party organization with a powerful mass movement behind it". Per Harold Isaacs, the Executive Committee of the Comintern ruled on January 12, 1923 that "... the E.C.C.I. considers that it is necessary to coordinate the activities of the Kuomintang and of the young Communist Party of China" and that "the Kuomintang should be the central force of the national revolution and should stand in the leading position". The Third Conference of the Chinese Communist Party in June 1923 agreed to the slogan: "All work to the Kuomintang!"

declaration on the party affairs, and reaffirmed the Three People's Principles as the basis and means of the Chinese revolutionary movement only.

Borodin's strategy was to have the CCP take control of all the local organizations of the KMT, develop a step by step plan to combat the KMT right-wing per Voitinsky's special instructions, and accelerate the inevitable split of the KMT left wing from the KMT right wing. On July 3, 1924, communists pushed through their agenda to have the KMT organize the Farmers' Bureau under the KMT central executive committee as well as launch the farmers' Movement Training Institute. In light of the fact that KMT right-wing leaders might call for a separation from communists in the upcoming plenary session of the Kuomintang, Karakhan in a letter to Borodin's dated July 12, 1924, gave instructions to strengthen the work to ally with the leftist (Centrist) Kuomintang. In August 1924, Zhou Enlai returned from overseas to take on the military department director post at the CCP Guangdong district commissariat. In the same month, communists, in the disguise of protecting Sun Yat-sen, organized on basis of two Soviet armored vehicles an armored vehicle force of the Marshall's headquarters.

From August 15 to 23, the KMT convened the 2<sup>nd</sup> plenary meeting of the first congress, with two resolutions passed on August 20<sup>th</sup> by the KMT central committee's political council in regards to the Issue of Communist Faction within the Kuomintang and the Issue of Liaison between the Kuomintang and the World Revolution, with the first act stressing the dominant position of the Three People's Principles and the power of the KMT to censure the Communists within the KMT's party platform, party constitution and disciplinary power, and the second act establishing the International Liaison Committee under the Political Committee of the KMT Central Executive Committee for direct contact with the Comintern to deal with the relationship of the KMT and the CPC. During the meeting, Sun Yat-sen, calling on the KMT members to learn the Russian revolutionary experience and especially to the Russian party organization, announced the expulsion of veteran KMT leader Feng Ziyou but pleaded with senior leader Zhang Ji to be given time to implement the measures or would yield the leadership role to Zhang Ji should he fail to carry through. On August 21<sup>st</sup>, at the graduation ceremony of the Peasant Movement Institute, Sun Yat-sen, while publicly announcing to follow the example of Soviet Russia's way, downplayed the Soviet land revolution scheme and emphasized the importance of peaceful land reform, namely, "to use pacific methods and appeal for cooperation" per Marie-Claire Bergère and Janet Lloy.

At about this timeframe, the KMT's image in Canton as anti-imperialism vanguard was elevated when the Shamen strike broke out from July 15 to Aug 20, 1924 "in protest against the security measures imposed by the British and French authorities following an assassination attempt in the Shamen concession against M. Merlin, the governor-general of Indochina, who was visiting Canton" per Marie-Claire Bergère and Janet Lloy. While the Shamen strike gave prestige to the KMT and indirectly the CCP, the confrontation with the Merchant Corps, which had the British backing, caused Sun Yat-sen headache. In the context of civil wars related to Sun Yat-sen's maneuvers, the Merchant Corps, which organized a volunteers' army to protect their business interests in Canton and across the province, expanded their headcounts to 50,000 men in summer 1924 versus 13,000 men in 1923. On Aug 9, a Norwegian cargo vessel, the Hav, carrying guns for the Merchant Corps Volunteers, was intercepted by the KMT forces near the Whampoa Island. Borodin and Chinese Communists advocated the total confiscation of the guns, while

KMT leaders such as Hu Hanmin and Wang Ching-wei suggested the solution to have the business group provide a loan to the Canton government as reimbursement for the confiscated firearms. Yunnan Army generals, such as Fan Shisheng and 廖行超 Liu Xingchao, at the request of the Merchant Corps, impolitely intervened to force Sun Yat-sen into a compromise. Liao Zhongkai, who supported Sun Yat-sen's harsh means to deal with the Merchant Corps, was forced to resign the duties as governor of Guangdong Province, yielding the post to Hu Hanmin. Feeling that the prestige was damaged by the insubordination of generals, and in face of the threat from the British as well as continuing internal party discords on the matter of alliance with the Soviets, Sun Yat-sen made a decision in early September to move his headquarters out of Canton and relaunched his command at Shaoguan, close to the Hunan provincial border. Further, Sun Yat-sen ordered Chiang Kai-shek to pack up the Whampoa cadets for a junction with him at Shaoguan, which Chiang Kai-shek refused to obey, claiming that he had a duty to safeguard the Whampoa citadel as the last bastion of revolution. In the letter to Chiang Kai-shek, Sun Yat-sen listed three reasons about the infeasibility of Canton, stating that "I have come to Shaoguan with the intention of abandoning Canton, cutting my bridges, so to speak."<sup>15</sup> Other than the merchant group, the Guangdong Province's Federated Chamber of Commerce 广东全省商业联合会 authored a letter to the overseas Chinese community to attack Sun Yat-sen's policy that was taken as the implementation of communism.

It was at this critical moment that things looked like Borodin and the Soviet scheme to utilize the KMT might abort itself when the Soviet cargo ship on October 7 delivered to Canton the first batch of shipments of weaponry, which included 8000 guns and 4 million rounds of ammunition. In early October of 1924, Sun Yat-sen, with the backing of 800 Soviet guns, hardened his stance towards the Merchant Corps. Borodin proposed to the Guangdong revolutionary government to set up a revolutionary committee to deal with business group, and at one time in the deliberations with Chiang Kai-shek on the choice of the Committee members, Borodin ruled out Hu Hanmin and Wang Ching-wei for the latter two's ambivalence towards the merchants. Chiang Kai-shek, commandant of the Whampoa Military Academy, was to become Borodin's darling for his unwavering stance during the confrontation between the KMT and the Canton merchants. The Whampoa Academy launched in spring 1924 with merely 30 guns' start-up equipment from the Canton arsenal, was "financed by 186,000 Chinese dollars from the Canton government and 3 million rubles (the equivalent of 2.7 million Chinese dollars) by the Soviets" per Marie-Claire Bergère and Janet Lloy. Chiang Kai-shek eventually trained the first and second classes of cadets to take part in the military campaign to quell rebel Chen Jiongming at Huizhou, as well as the Merchant Corps volunteers and the Yunnan provincial army at Canton in the following year.

At the end of 1924, Sun Yat-sen, against the objection of the KMT party leaders and at the instigation of Borodin, took the northern trip to Peking in the attempt at reorganizing the Chinese government in the aftermath of Feng Yuxiang's coup that overthrew the Cao Kun presidency. With Sun Yat-sen gone from Canton, Borodin became the paramount KMT leader at home, and in February 1925, Borodin sent in "Canton government troops to reinforce the peasant associations in their struggle against the village militias" while Sun Yat-sen was on his deathbed

---

<sup>15</sup> Sun Yat-sen By Marie-Claire Bergère, Janet Lloy  
Marie-Claire Bergère, Janet Lloyd  
Stanford University Press, 1998. P. 349.

in Peking per Marie-Claire Bergère and Janet Lloy. In Moscow, Chinese Communists in February 1925 obtained Soviet approval to transfer selected members, such as Xiong Xiong, Wang Yifei, Nie Rongzhen, Yan Changshuo et al., to the Soviet Red Army College. In August, the Far Eastern Department of the Comintern passed an act to instruct the CCP to conduct military work in China. Chinese Communists in September sent Wang Yifei and about twenty-six cadres back to China, where they convened a 2nd expanded plenary meeting of the CCP 4th congress in Peking to launch military committees in the three hot spots of Peking, Canton, and Henan, with Li Dazhao, Tan Pingshan and Wang Ruofei in charge respectively. In Canton, Borodin and Chinese Communists expanded the marshal's armored unit to a 2,000-men communist-inclusive independent regiment headed by Ye Ting, with nominal subordination to the Cantonese Army. By July 1926, the number of members of the Communist Party of China ascended to 57,000 in contrast with 432 members at the CCP 3<sup>rd</sup> congress in June 1923, with Chinese Communist Party members in active participation in the KMT's political, military and administrative organs at all levels.

On the KMT side, Chiang Kai-shek, with Borodin's endorsement, began to ascend in the party and military leadership after Sun Yat-sen's death. [[Galin]], after one and a half months' persuasion, convinced the Canton government to send troops to crusade against Chen Chiung-ming's rebels at Huizhou in late January of 1925. On April 6<sup>th</sup>, 1925, Borodin supported Liao Zhongkai to form a Soviet-style KMT "party army", with Chiang Kai-shek acting as commander-in-chief and Liao Zhongkai commissar. However, in the summer of 1925, the Soviet Union shifted its focus to North China to render direct military aid to Feng Yuxiang in the expectation of gaining control of the Peking government, hence suspending the preparations of military work for the Northern Expedition. The pace of radicalization in Canton led to the assassination death of Liao Zhongkai by the KMT right wing in August 1925, for which Hu Hanmin was deprived of his posts at the Canton government for his family member's implication and was sent by Borodin on a trip to Moscow for studies. In August, Wang Ching-wei, under Borodin's support, tacked on the post as chairman of the reorganized national government of Canton. On November 23, 1925, 14 senior KMT leaders assembled at Biyunshi (blue cloud monastery) on Mt Xiangshan (flagrant hill) in the West Hills area of Peking to launch a separate 4th plenum of the 1st KMT congress, for which those conservative members came to be known as the West Hill Faction. In January 1926, the Comintern's executive committee admitted the KMT as a non-official sponsored member. In February, Hu Hanmin attended the 6<sup>th</sup> congress [[共产国际执行委员会第六届全体会议]] of the Comintern as a representative of the KMT party. In March 1926, Chiang Kai-shek, who was fed up with the Soviets and communists' objection to the northern expedition, conducted a bloodless coup that came to be known as the Zhongshan Warship Incident, which led to the expulsion of Soviet adviser [[Kissanga]] and the downfall of chairman Wang Ching-wei. Months later, Shao Lizi, as a KMT representative, attended another Comintern meeting together with the CCP members. In year 1925, the Soviets transported to Canton the firearms and ammunition valued at 564,000 rubles, followed by delivery in 1926 of four batches of weaponry with a variety of ordnance, mainly rifles and some two dozens of artillery pieces. The Soviets, other than the Whampoa Academy, provided funds, guns and advisers to the military schools run by the provincial armies from Yunnan and Hunan, Ji Jishen's Guangdong Army 1<sup>st</sup> Division, as well as Wu Tiecheng's police academy and a

rudimentary aviation school. To deceive the eyes and ears of the world community, the Soviet Union declared that its adviser in Canton were all retired militarymen and served as volunteers. On August 4, 1926, the Soviet Ambassador Karakhan further dispelled rumors in an answer to inquiry from the Peking government, claiming that there was no facts to rumors about Soviet military aids to the Canton Guangdong government for enabling a Northern Expedition and disturbing the tranquility of the provinces.

+++back to Peking negotiation+++

With Stalin repealing the Davtian Agreement, the Soviet agents were ordered to return to negotiations with central government in Beijing. The Soviets dispatched its top diplomat, Lev Mikhailovich Karakhanov (Lev Karakhan), to Peking, at about the same time Borodin was sent to Canton. Before Karakhan's arrival, in August 1923, the diplomatic corps issued a 16-country ultimatum (《十六国通牒》) to China in regards to the Lincheng train hijacking in Shandong Province, with a call for sending in an international railway guards' army for the protection of foreign nationals traveling on China's railways as well as a demand for a delay "to fulfill the decisions of the Washington conference with regard to China, before the military and financial situation in China has improved" per Tony Saich in "The origins of the first United Front in China: the role of Sneevliet (alias Maring)". In this kind of environment, Karakhan arrived in Peking on September 2<sup>nd</sup> to receive a warm welcome from Chinese of all walks of life. Karakhan subsequently issued a third manifesto, acknowledging the previous two manifestos to serve as principle and spirit for Sino-Soviet talks.. On October 2<sup>nd</sup>, 1923, the Chinese foreign ministry, at the persuasion of Wang Zhengting, decided to loosen the preconditions before talking about diplomatic relations with Soviet Russian and further empowered Wang Zhengting as a plenipotentiary to work on a draft agreement on the outlines. Karakhan, unlike predecessor Joffe, maintained duplicity in keeping the Soviet demands behind the scene, and demanded unconditional diplomatic recognition from China before negotiating new treaties to replace the old ones. While Wang Zhengting was visiting Tokyo in late 1923 to check on earthquake victims of the overseas Chinese community as well as to seek Japanese opinions on the ongoing Sino-Soviet talks, Karakhan publicly refuted the validity of the Yanson text in regards to the Chinese Eastern Railway. Again with Li Dazhao's special arrangement, Karakhan, the new Soviet plenipotentiary, frequently met with Feng Yuxiang to discuss about the Soviet revolution.

In January 1924, China sent 李家鏊 Li Jiaao to Moscow as a diplomatic representative. In early February of 1924, Britain, Italy and Norway recognized the Soviet Union. After Karakhan raised a protest and demanded with Wellington Koo to have Wang Zhengting replaced, China in late February contemplated on forgoing the preconditions. On February 25<sup>th</sup>, Wang Zhengting proposed to Karakhan to have the "draft agreement on the outline for settling the Sino-Russian outstanding cases" 《解决中俄悬案大纲协定草案》 to state the annulment of old Sino-Russian treaties and agreements and the signing of new Sino-Soviet treaties and agreements. On March 1<sup>st</sup>, Karakhan countered with the suggestion to conditionally annul the old Sino-Russian treaties and agreements at the to-be-scheduled treaty negotiation conference. From Moscow, Li Jiaao on the 11<sup>th</sup> relayed Georgii Chicherin's opinion that the Soviets were no longer bound by the manifestos made three years ago since situation had changed over the years. On the early morning of the 14<sup>th</sup>, Wang Zhengting and Karakhan signed the "draft agreement on the outlines

for settling the Sino-Russian outstanding cases” 《解决中俄悬案大纲协定草案》, with Article III of the aforementioned Agreement adopting Karakhan’s position that “the Governments of two Contracting Parties agree to annul at the [to-be-scheduled] Conference, as provided in the proceeding Article, all Conventions, Treaties, Agreements, Protocols, Contracts, etcetera, concluded between the Government of China and Tsarist Government, and to replace them with new treaties, agreements, etcetera, on the basis of equality, reciprocity and justice, as well as the spirit the Declarations of the Soviet Government of the years of 1919 and 1920.” The concession that China obtained, i.e., a separate Secret Protocol 《议定书》, was to trap China in a limbo status with an ambiguous statement stating that “pending the conclusion of such new treaties, agreements, etcetera, all the old Conventions, Treaties, Agreements, Protocols, Contracts, etcetera, will not be enforced.”<sup>16</sup> As validated by historian Bruce A. Elleman, to force Beijing to sign the draft treaty as written, including this secret protocol, Karakhan issued a three-day ultimatum. In particular, he exerted public pressure on Koo and Wang by means of the United Front between Chinese Communists and Sun Yat-sen.”<sup>17</sup>

While talking to the Peking government about renewing diplomatic relations, Karakhan, through the Soviet mole Yang Zhuo, negotiated simultaneously with Zhang Zuolin on the issue of the Chinese Eastern Railway, and navigation rights on the Sungari River and the Amur River, etc. Yang Zhuo, who enjoyed titles such as councilor at the Manchurian Army commander-in-chief’s headquarters and lieutenant inspector of the Chinese Eastern Railway, 张作霖咨议、中东铁路稽查处长、监察员, was sent to Peking in March for previewing the draft Peking agreement. Further, Karakhan started negotiations with Japan, when “Kenkichi Yoshizawa opened talks with Karakhan in late March 1924” in Peking. Japan, interested in retaining the 1875 Treaty of St. Petersburg, the 1905 Portsmouth Peace Treaty, the 1907 Fishing Convention, and the 1907 Secret Treaty, proposed on 17 May 1924 an article to the effect that the “Treaty of Peace of 1905 shall remain in force in its entirety. Other treaties and agreements concluded between Japan and Russia shall be replaced by new treaties and agreements so as to conform to new situation, it being understood that all rights and interests secured through old treaties and agreements to the High Contracting Parties and respective nationals shall be respected.”<sup>18</sup> The Soviets were cunning enough not to rush to talks on renewing old treaties with Japan, and “as late as 24 May 1924, however, Karakhan repeated yet again that the Soviet position was to first ‘open diplomatic relations’ and only later negotiate new treaties.”<sup>19</sup> In Peking, as a result of disagreement between Wang Zhengting and the Chinese foreign ministry, Wellington Koo was empowered with the task to directly renegotiate with Karakhan on the

<sup>16</sup> Bruce A. Elleman, *Diplomacy and Deception: the Secret History of Sino-Soviet Diplomatic Relations, 1917—1927* (M. E. Sharpe, 1997), p. 101

<sup>17</sup> *Wilson and China: A Revised History of the Shandong Question*

By Bruce A. Elleman. M.E. Sharpe, Jun 1, 2002. P. 164.

Also see *Manchurian Railways and the Opening of China: An International History*

By Bruce A. Elleman, Stephen Kotkin

M.E. Sharpe, Nov 30, 2009

“Karakhan sent an ultimatum to Foreign Minister Koo on 16 March, insisting that the Beijing government recognize the draft treaty unchanged within three days of the 14 March draft treaty.”

<sup>18</sup> *Wilson and China: A Revised History of the Shandong Question*

By Bruce A. Elleman. M.E. Sharpe, Jun 1, 2002. P. 166.

<sup>19</sup> *Wilson and China: A Revised History of the Shandong Question*

By Bruce A. Elleman. M.E. Sharpe, Jun 1, 2002. P. 166.

unfavorable terms in regard to the term ‘pending the conclusion of such new treaties’. To exert pressure on the Peking government, two Chinese related to Li Dazhao’s Chinese Communist Party were sent to Wellington Koo’s residence to deliver a timer bomb which accidentally killed a servant.

In May 1924, the Soviets struck the Sino-Russo Agreement 中俄协定 with the Peking government, which allowed the Soviets to retain the co-management and co-ownership of the railway for 80 years [since 1896]. Following the May 1924 railway agreement, the Peking government, which was represented by Wellington Koo, and Leo Karakhan, representative of the Soviet Union, signed on May 31<sup>st</sup>, 1924 the “Agreement of an Outline for Resolving the Sino-Russo Outstanding Cases”, 《中俄解决悬案大纲协定》 which contained the body of the 15-article agreement [i.e., the 14 March 1924 draft treaty verbatim], seven Declarations, one diplomatic exchange of Notes, the 11-article note on the " Agreement for the Provisional Management of the Chinese Eastern Railway " 《暂行管理中东铁路协定》, and the Secret Protocol. The Secret Protocol, which was first signed between Wang Zhengting and Karakhan months ago, was kept out of the public. The eleven-article "Agreement for the Provisional Management of the Chinese Eastern Railway" made the CER “an exclusive Sino-Soviet joint venture”, as a result of which “the interests of all of the other ‘stockholders, bondholders and creditors of the Chinese Eastern Railway Company’ were completely ignored” per Bruce A. Elleman in “Diplomacy and deception: the secret history of Sino-Soviet diplomatic relations, 1917-1927”.

The Sino-Soviet Agreement nominally nullified all Conventions , Treaties , Agreement s , Protocols , Contract s , etcetera , concluded between the Government of China and Tsarist Government; gave up the Boxer Indemnity, relinquished the concessions in China, and abolished consular jurisdiction and extraterritoriality; promised not to provide support to organization to topple the respective governments of China and the Soviet Union; gave China the right of redemption for the Chinese Eastern Railway that was to undergo co-ownership and co-management with equal representation. However, the secret protocol, not being publicly acknowledged to the outside world, left the old Sino-Russian treaties in an ambiguous state of being neither abolished nor enforced. Hence, the Soviet promises became hollow as to abolishing all treaties, including those entered into by Russia and third countries, in the future or past and at the present; that were detrimental to China's sovereignty and interests, or the renegotiation of tariffs and reparations of damages incurred by the overseas Chinese during the Soviet civil wars, or the nullification of unequal treaties that would impact the territory demarcation, such as the "Treaty of Tientsin" of 1858 and the First Convention of Peking of 1860, or the recognition of Outer Mongolia as part of the Republic of China, or the Soviet promise to complete withdrawal of troops from Mongolia – since the Sino-Soviet conference, which was scheduled to start within one month of the Sino-Soviet Agreement to discuss the above-mentioned issues, could be forever delayed pending convenience of the Soviets. When the conference finally started in August 1925, “the Soviet diplomats quickly demanded that China reaffirm the former Sino-Russian unequal treaties, and all negotiations subsequently deadlocked” per Ellema in “Diplomacy and deception: the secret history of Sino-Soviet diplomatic relations, 1917-1927”. The Soviets, in order to delay the scheduled Sino-Soviet conference so as to maintain the territorial concessions and privileges from unequal treaties, sabotaged the Republic of China by fomenting Chinese civil wars from 1925 onward. What China obtained was a superficial diplomatic victory, which

both the northern government and the southern government utilized to exert pressure on the Nine Power Treaty countries to rescind the unequal treaties and boxer indemnity payments etc.

Having achieved the objective of wrapping up a Sino-Soviet agreement with a catch-22 secret protocol, Karakhan, in lieu of opening up the conference within one month and ratifying new treaties no later than another six months as stipulated, “delayed the convening of the official Sino-Soviet conference for fourteen months after the official treaty was signed”, and demanded with Wellington Koo that “the joint management of the CER had to be in effect prior to the convening of the Sino-Soviet conference” [on basis of Article IX of the agreement which stated that “the CER would be jointly managed by the Soviet Union and China until its status was determined at the upcoming Sino-Soviet conference”] as well as resorted to Article I to demand that “all former Russian consulates and government property should be turned over to the Soviet government”.<sup>20</sup> While China satisfied Karakhan’s two preconditions, i.e., returning Russian embassy and consulates to the Soviet government and making Karakhan the first full Soviet ambassador to China, the Peking government refused to commence the start of joint management of the CER which was under Zhang Zuolin’s de facto control property-wise. In the course of restoring the legation in Peking, Karakhan, partly playing into the powers’ fear of losing the rights and privileges from the unequal treaties with China (i.e., the Boxer Protocol and etc), displayed his duplicity in claiming to the powers that the 1901 Boxer Protocols and the 1904 legation quarter agreement were still binding.

In early June, Yang Zhuo took a copy of the Peking Agreement’s outline and the declarations back to Mukden. On June 9<sup>th</sup>, Japanese newspapers in Manchuria first reported that Zhang Zuolin had negated the Peking agreement. While Yang Zhuo, the Soviet mole, playing into Zhang Zuolin’s resentment over the Soviet repeal of the Davtian Agreement, superficially extracted a better term with a shortened timeframe of 60 years [since the original contract date of 1896] for China to redeem the railway,<sup>21</sup> the end result was the Soviet monopoly of the Chinese Eastern Railway through manipulations of two secret protocols, respectively. Sometime in June, Karakhan disclosed to Koo about the ongoing Soviet negotiation with Zhang Zuolin in regards to the CER and some other ‘minor matters’ (i.e., the CER concession area which was 250,000 acres in size), cunningly promised that even with “a separate agreement with Chang Tso-lin, the agreement with Peking would still be considered valid”, and falsely claimed that he “would submit any such treaty [between the USSR and Zhang Zuolin] to Peking for its approval”. In early August, Yang Zhuo promised to submit any Mukden-Soviet Agreement to Peking for ratification, which did not materialize. On September 9<sup>th</sup>, Yang Zhuo travelled to Peking to complete the Mukden-Soviet Agreement. Notwithstanding Koo’s repeated warning “not to interfere with Peking’s efforts to convince Chang Tso-lin to accept the May 31, 1924 agreement on the CER,” the Soviets, claiming to have the Peking government’s prior approval, hoodwinked Zhang Zuolin with omission of the secret protocol of the Peking agreement, “signed a

---

<sup>20</sup> As rightly pointed out by Ellema, “when the conference finally met in August 1925, new treaties and conventions concerning the CER were never completed, this leaving the secret protocol in effect.” *Diplomacy and deception: the secret history of Sino-Soviet diplomatic relations, 1917-1927*. Bruce A. Ellema. M.E. Sharpe, 1997. P. 124.

<sup>21</sup> Under the 1896 treaty, China could not rebuy the railroad before 1932, and to receive it without paying any compensation would have to wait until 1976.

supplemental agreement and a new secret protocol with the Manchurian "Autonomous Three Eastern Provinces" on September 20, 1924".<sup>22</sup>

In September 1924, the Soviets struck the Mukden-Russo Agreement 奉俄协定 with Zhang Zuolin's Manchurian government, with a shortened duration of 60 years for the Soviets to retain the co-management and co-ownership of the railway, with "the inclusion of a secret protocol" that "actually meant that Moscow's agreement with Chang superseded its agreement with Peking."<sup>23</sup> The agreement, which was wrongly treated by Chinese historians as a Soviet reinsurance treaty for the Soviet Union to control the Chinese Eastern Railway Again, contained similar statements as the Peking Agreement to the effect that the Chinese Eastern Railway was completely commercial in nature, and that China had the right to exercise redemption by agreement between the two parties. While the Soviets renounced the judiciary, civil, military, police, municipal, tax power, as well as stocks and bonds to China, the acres of land in the CER concession was retained under the control of the CER. Further the agreement provided that the future of the railway could only be decided by China and the Soviet Union, with no interference from a third party. The reduction of the Peking agreement's 80 years to 60 years was attributed to the negotiating 'skills' of undercover Soviet agent Yang Zhuo. The provisions of the Sino-Mukden Agreement stipulated a composition of a ten-member board of trustees, comprising of five persons each from China and the Soviet Union, and a management bureau consisting of one director and two deputies. While the Chinese side held the nominal chairman post of the board, the Soviet side retained the post of director of the management bureau. In reality, the Soviet Union dominated the real power in the personnel at the Chinese Eastern Railway, in violation of the principle of equal treatment and allocation of posts. As validated by Ellema, the Soviets used two techniques to take majority control of the railway "by playing the two secret protocols off each other". In lieu of the clause of "equal representation between the nationals" as stipulated in the Peking agreement, Karakhan worded the agreement with Zhang Zuolin to state that "in carrying out the principles of equal representation the normal course of life and activities of the Railway shall in no case be interrupted or injured, that is to say the employment of the people of both nationalities shall be based in accordance with experience, personal qualifications and fitness of the applicants." Subsequently, Karakhan, taking advantage of Zhang Zuolin's ignorance of the Peking secret protocol that invalidated the 1896 CER contract, impressed the latter to believe that "the 1896 CER contract would continue to be valid during the first four months of operation", hence achieving the goal of controlling 24 out of 26 CER committees and subcommittees, with 120 Soviet officials vs. 80 Chinese, 11,251 Soviet staff versus 5,556.55 Chinese staff.<sup>24</sup> Zhang Zuolin later in January 1927 ordered the arrest of Yang Zhuo on the

---

<sup>22</sup> Diplomacy and deception: the secret history of Sino-Soviet diplomatic relations, 1917-1927

Bruce A. Ellema

M.E. Sharpe, 1997. Pp. 125-127.

<sup>23</sup> As disclosed to Wellington Koo by Karakhan in June, the Soviets intentionally changed the terms with the Manchurian overlord to sixty years, and claimed that "the cost of purchasing the railway from the Soviet Union would be determined as the "original cost" of building the railway, or some 200 to 300 million rubles, instead of the current appraised value of 700 million rubles." See Bruce A. Ellema's Diplomacy and deception: the secret history of Sino-Soviet diplomatic relations, 1917-1927

<sup>24</sup> Diplomacy and deception: the secret history of Sino-Soviet diplomatic relations, 1917-1927

Bruce A. Ellema

M.E. Sharpe, 1997. Pp. 127-131.

purported tip from Amleto Vespa (1888-c.1940) and executed him on the pretext that the latter colluded with the KMT left-wing government in Wuhan, Hubei Province.

Karakhan's next move was to build upon the success of the secret protocol with Zhang Zuolin to strike a deal with Japan so as to retain the Tsarist interests in Manchuria. As Ellema correctly reasoned, when Chang Tso-lin renounced autonomy and on January 19, 1925, sent a copy of the September 20, 1924 supplemental agreement's secret protocol to the Peking government –which was under the joint custody of Feng Yuxiang, Duan Qirui and Zhang Zuolin in the aftermath of Feng Yuxiang's coup against the Cao Kun presidency – Japan, “faced with a renewed threat from [Soviet] Russia”, “agreed to return to the status quo ante in existence prior to World War I” while “in May 1924, the Japanese government had offered its help to China in managing the Chinese share of the CER” per Bruce A. Ellema in “Diplomacy and deception: the secret history of Sino-Soviet diplomatic relations, 1917-1927” In duplicity similar to the acknowledgment of the Boxer Protocols in front of the rest of the eight powers, Karakhan renewed the Tsarist Russia's secret treaties with Japan in the Soviet-Japanese Convention signed on 11 February 1925, which “reaffirmed the validity of the Portsmouth Peace Treaty of 5 September 1905”, and “the pre-war imperialist treaties dividing China had been recreated”, hence making Manchuria into ‘competing Soviet and Japanese spheres of influence’ per Bruce A. Ellema in “Wilson and China: A Revised History of the Shandong Question”. Ellema continued to point out:

With the renewal of secret treaties, the revival of former spheres of influence “in turn initiated an interwar Soviet-Japanese competition for control over China.” In the process, Karakhan “supported Japan by recognizing the Twenty-one demands, a decision that Wilson consistently refused to make at Paris.” Back on March 10<sup>th</sup>, 1923, China had conveyed the resolutions of the upper and lower houses of the Chinese parliament to declare null and void the 1915 Treaty with Japan. When Shen Ruilin, China's foreign minister, “secretly protested this Soviet-Japanese Convention on 11 February 1925”, Karakhan countered by reference to “China's agreements with Japan signed in 1905 and 1915, both of which affirmed the Portsmouth agreement”, and separately Georgii Chicherin in Moscow replied to the Chinese minister with the same justification, and “the reference to a 1915 treaty with Japan was none other than the Twenty-one Demands.”

The USSR and Japan, having successfully renewed political and economic relations, signed a separate secret protocol among themselves. With the secret agreements with the Manchurian warlord Zhang Zuolin and with Japan, “Karakhan was able to regain control over the Chinese Eastern railway, over many of Russia's territorial concessions throughout China, and over Outer Mongolia” per Bruce A. Elleman<sup>in</sup> Wilson and China: A Revised History of the Shandong Question.

In 1925, the Japanese, in light of the lessened military actions from the Korean nationalists and cut-off support from the Soviets, struck a deal with the Manchuria authorities on policing the border area, in lieu of conducting military sweep campaigns that came from three directions of Port Arthur to the west, Jiandao (Hunchun) to the east and Korea across the Yalu River. On June 11<sup>th</sup>, Mitsuya Miyamatsu, a police superintendent of the Korean governor-general's office, reached a Mitsuya Agreement with Yu Zhen in regards to the Manchurian authority's cooperation on the arrest and extradition of the Korean rebels, which was construed to be a “a

withdrawal from the policy advocated since 1915”<sup>25</sup> The Soviets, however, ended its rapprochement with Zhang Zuolin, the Manchurian overlord, and from mid-1925 onward, sought to overthrow Zhang Zuolin’s rule by exerting enormous amounts of military and financial aid to Feng Yuxiang and Sun Chuanfang as well as instigating the rebellion of Manchurian Army generals such as Guo Songlin and Li Jinglin etc al.

The Soviets, adamant on the world revolution, set their eyes on the Chinese continent after setbacks in instigating the military uprisings in Germany and Hungary, giving guns to all the warring factions in China without regard for the ten-year arms embargo that was imposed by the powers since the end of WWI to stop the surplus WWI weapons from flooding and destabilizing the Chinese market. The Chinese parties which had received Soviet guns and ammunition would include Feng Yuxiang, Sun Chuanfang and Sun Yat-sen. Beginning from late 1924, Karakhan, feeling complacent about his victory in the diplomatic rounds with the Peking government and the Mukden government, threw the Soviet military support behind militarists such as Feng Yuxiang whose army was already the recruit ground for future Soviet G.R.U. agent. In the public, Lev Karakhan repeatedly suggested to the Republic of China to unilaterally revoke the unequal treaties for sake of provoking a direct confrontation between China and the powers. The Soviets, in order to permanently delay the Sino-Soviet Conference that started in August 1925, sought to overthrow Cao Kun's government by utilizing communist Li Dazhao as go-between to instigate Feng Yuxiang into a mutiny. In October 1924, Feng Yuxiang conducted a coup and overthrew Cao Kun’s Peking government by taking advantage of Wu Peifu’s war with the Manchurian Army at the Pass of the Mountain and Sea. The Peking coup, termed the "revolution at the capital", was followed by years of Soviet-agitated civil wars among militarists and the 1926-1927 Northern Expedition, which was to render the Sino-Soviet Outline Agreement null and void as to China's recovery of rights and interests from Tsarist unequal treaties while giving the Soviet Union benefits of monopolizing the Chinese Eastern Railway and recovering assets such as legation quarters and churches. Additionally, the Soviets, taking advantage of the chaos in China, officially abolished the puppet Mongolia monarchy and proclaimed the puppet People's Republic of Mongolia on November 26th, which was a resounding slap on the face of the Sino-Soviet Outline Agreement with the Republic of China.

Ah Xiang

[webmaster@republicanchina.org](mailto:webmaster@republicanchina.org)

Modified March 27, 2012, on basis of

[http://republicanchina.org/USSR\\_Comintern\\_Alliance\\_With\\_KMT&CCP.v0.pdf](http://republicanchina.org/USSR_Comintern_Alliance_With_KMT&CCP.v0.pdf)

---

<sup>25</sup> Erik Esselstrom, Crossing empire's edge: Foreign Ministry police and Japanese expansionism in northeast Asia, University of Hawaii Press, 2009 p. 88